

8th IANA Review Committee Meeting

19 December 2018 | 12PM UTC

Draft Minutes

Attendees

AFRINIC

Community Representatives:

Noah Maina (NM)

Omo Oaiya (OO)

APNIC

Community Representatives:

Bertrand Cherrier (BC)

Simon Sohel Baroi (SB)

Staff Representative:

George Kuo (GK)

ARIN

Community Representatives:

Louie Lee (LL)

Jason Schiller (JS) (Co-Chair)

Staff Representative:

Richard Jimmerson (RJ)

LACNIC

Community Representative:

Nicolas Antonello (NA)

Staff Representative:

Ernesto Majó (EM)

RIPE NCC

Community Representative:

Nurani Nimpuno (NN) (Chair)

Filiz Yilmaz (FY)

Staff Representative:

Felipe Silveira (FS)

Secretariat

German Valdez (GV) - Executive Secretary

Apologies:

Madhvi Gokool (*AFRINIC Staff Representative*)

Scribe:

Susannah Gray (SG)

New Action Items

- **NEW ACTION ITEM 181219-01: RJ to send a mail to the RIR representatives to begin the process of compiling the 2018 matrix.**
- **NEW ACTION ITEM 181219-02: Secretariat to ensure that email and details regarding comments on the RC Report are visible on the IANA RC pages on the NRO website.**
- **NEW ACTION ITEM 181219-03: Secretariat to send out a Doodle poll to find a date for a meeting during the first two weeks of January 2019.**
- **NEW ACTION ITEM 181219-04: JS to propose changes to the RC Operating Procedures once the RC Report has been completed [TABLED until March/April].**

Agenda

1. Welcome
2. Review of Open Action Items
3. Review of Performance Reports 2018
4. Review Process 2019
5. RC Chair Election
6. Next Meeting - Jan 2019
7. AOB
8. Adjourn

1. Welcome

GV performed the roll call and declared quorum.

EM noted that Esteban Lescano, as per LACNIC procedures, had stepped down from his position on the RC as he had joined the LACNIC Board. A new LACNIC representative would be appointed soon.

NN welcomed the attendees and gave a brief overview of the IANA RC's work for the benefit of new members.

2. Review Open Actions

ACTION ITEM 20180425-1: JS, NN to compile all the proposed changes to the RC operating procedures as discussed and circulate a new draft on the mailing list.

CLOSED.

ACTION ITEM 20180425-2: All review the new draft of the operating procedures and raise any concerns within one week of receipt.

CLOSED.

ACTION ITEM 20180425-3: GV to send a Doodle poll in November to schedule a teleconference at the end of November/beginning of December.

CLOSED.

ACTION ITEM 20180425-4: GV to open the call for nominations for RC Chair on 7 January 2019.

PENDING.

ACTION ITEM 20180425-5: GV to add RJ to the RC mailing list.

CLOSED.

3. Review of Performance Reports 2018

RJ noted that ARIN staff had reviewed the 2018 performance reports and had found no conflict with what was reported.

NN noted that each month's report states:

- Requests acknowledged on time (100%)
- Responded on time (100%)
- Implemented on time (100%)
- Implemented accurately (100%)

GK confirmed that APNIC had reviewed the reports and had found no issues.

4. Review Process 2019

NN gave an overview of the activities that the RC would need to complete next year.

She explained that the RIR staff representatives would compile the matrix, which was a compilation of all of the 2018 performance reports. The matrix would then be added to the RC's final Report. She noted that, last year, the formatting made it difficult to add the matrix to the RC's final report so this should be taken into consideration this time around.

RJ volunteered to coordinate with the RIR representatives once the December performance report had been received.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181219-01: RJ to send a mail to the RIR representatives to begin the process of compiling the 2018 matrix.

JS noted that, in addition to compiling the matrix, the RIRs could comment on the reports if they had any concerns regarding the performance reports.

NN added that, as noted in the operating procedures, the RIRs could add a summary if they would like to.

NN explained that, once the matrix was compiled, the next step was to draft the RC Report. She suggested that the RC start to draft the RC Report at the first meeting of 2019.

NN noted that, when the RC report is finalized, it would be published on the IANA RC pages on the NRO website and the community would be invited to comment on it by sending feedback to a dedicated email address. She noted that one RC member from each region monitored the email and asked that each region puts forward a volunteer for this during the January meeting.

NN asked the Secretariat to check whether the email address and a note stating that no comments were received on the 2017 RC Report were published on the NRO website.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181219-02: Secretariat to ensure that email and details regarding comments on the RC Report are visible on the IANA RC pages on the NRO website.

5. RC Chair Election

NN explained that the IANA RC's Operating Procedures state that the nominations for the RC Chair should close during the first RC meeting of the year. The previous Chair would chair this first meeting of the year and the selection period would begin immediately following the meeting. The new Chair would select the Vice Chair during the second meeting of the year.

6. Next Meeting - Jan 2019

JS asked if the current meeting time (12 UTC) was convenient for everyone.

There was some discussion on this. The group decided that 12 UTC was convenient.

NN note that, during the first meeting of the year, the RC would set the meeting schedule for 2019.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181219-03: Secretariat to send out a Doodle poll to find a date for a meeting during the first two weeks of January 2019.

7. AOB

JS noted that there had been some confusion regarding the recently updated Operating Procedures.

He explained that suggested text edits that were made to the Operating Procedures on Google Docs were visible as redline text. However, if the viewer was not logged in, none of the redline comments or suggested changes were visible and the viewer saw only the original text.

He added that this would explain why there had been some confusion about who had or had not seen the proposed changes to the text.

JS continued that while the text for the proposed changes to the Operating Procedures was also sent in clear text to the mailing list, there were now three different copies of changes to the Operating Procedures: a document *without* redline changes visible (not logged in view), a document *with* visible redline changes (logged in view), and the proposed new text that was sent in the body of an email. It is therefore not clear if all members of the RC were looking at the same document and whether all were agreeing to the make the same changes.

JS apologized for the confusion and suggested that the RC should review the suggested changes to the Operating Procedures again.

LL noted that the error was not intentional. He noted that, for future collaborative work taking place on Google Docs, people must be logged in to ensure that they see all comments and suggestions.

NN added that aside from the logging-in issue, the document had not been shared with everyone on the RC and not everyone had editing rights so they were not able to see any of the suggested text.

FY noted that she had seen the text with the suggested edits. The text that might not have been seen by everyone is quite minimal. She suggested keeping the current published Operating Procedures and revisiting the suggested changes in the new year.

JS agreed: as some people might have not seen the suggested changes, the RC should be given time to review the text.

NN noted that the suggested edits to the text would not affect the RC's work in the coming months. As the Secretariat also did not have access rights, it was asked to publish the procedures and published the version *without* any of the agreed upon changes.

She suggested that the RC worked on the Operating Procedures in 2019 after the RC Report had been published: JS could propose the changes as per the procedures and, if there is consensus, the changes would be implemented.

There were no objections.

NEW ACTION ITEM 181219-04: JS to propose changes to the RC Operating Procedures once the RC Report has been completed [TABLED until March/April].

NA noted that this would be his last meeting, as a new LACNIC Community Representative would join the RC as of 2019. He thanked the RC for their work.

NN thanked NA for his contributions and wished him success in the future.

SB noted that this was also his last meeting, as his one-year appointment by the APNIC community would end at the end of 2018. He thanked the RC for their work.

NN thank SB for his contributions and wished him success in the future.

8. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 13:00 UTC.