

IANA Review Committee Meeting

17 January 2019 | 12PM UTC
Draft Minutes

Attendees

AFRINIC

Community Representatives:

Noah Maina (NM)

Omo Oaiya (OO)

AFRINIC Staff Representative:

Madhvi Gokool

APNIC

Community Representatives:

Bertrand Cherrier (BC)

Staff Representative:

George Kuo (GK)

ARIN

Community Representatives:

Louie Lee (LL)

Jason Schiller (JS) (Co-Chair)

Staff Representative:

Richard Jimmerson (RJ)

LACNIC

Community Representative:

Juan Alejo Peirano (JP)

Glenn Peace (GP)

Staff Representative:

Ernesto Majó (EM)

RIPE NCC

Community Representative:

Nurani Nimpuno (NN) (Chair)

Filiz Yilmaz (FY)

Secretariat

German Valdez (GV) - Executive Secretary

Apologies

Felipe Silveira (FS) (*RIPE NCC Staff Representative*)
Syam Zufadly (SZ) (*APNIC Community Representative*)

Scribe:

Susannah Gray (SG)

New Action Items

- **NEW ACTION 190117-1: NN/JS to publish RIR Matrix announcement by 22 January.**

Agenda

0. Welcome
1. Agenda Review
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Review of Open Action Items
4. IANA RC Chair Nominations
5. RIR IANA Performance Matrix
6. RC Report Work Plan
7. AOB
8. Adjourn

0. Welcome

NN welcomed the IANA RC members to the first call of 2019.

GV performed the roll call and declared quorum.

1. Agenda Review

No items were added to the agenda.

2. Approval of Minutes

The minutes from the 19 December 2018 IANA RC Meeting were approved. NN asked the Secretariat to publish the minutes on the NRO website.

3. Review of Open Action Items

- **ACTION ITEM 181219-01: RJ to send a mail to the RIR representatives to begin the process of compiling the 2018 matrix > CLOSED.**

RJ noted that had recently sent a mail to the IANA RC mailing list and had asked for feedback on the updated version of the matrix.

- **ACTION ITEM 181219-02: Secretariat to ensure that email and details regarding comments on the RC Report are visible on the IANA RC pages on the NRO website > CLOSED.**

NN noted that SG had made changes to the IANA RC pages on the NRO website.

- **ACTION ITEM 181219-03: Secretariat to send out a Doodle poll to find a date for a meeting during the first two weeks of January 2019 > CLOSED.**
- **ACTION ITEM 181219-04: JS to propose changes to the RC Operating Procedures once the RC Report has been completed > OPEN [TABLED until March/April].**

4. IANA RC Chair Nominations

NN explained that, according to the IANA RC procedures, the nomination period for the IANA RC Chair closes during the first teleconference of the year. She noted that FY had nominated her for the Chair role for 2019 and OO had seconded the nomination.

NN continued that she accepted the nomination. She asked if anyone would like to nominate another candidate or nominate himself or herself for the role of Chair.

There were no further nominations.

NN noted that, for transparency reasons, it would be prudent to hold an e-vote even though there was only one nomination. She added that there was nothing written in the Operating Procedures that stipulates that a formal e-vote must be held.

She asked the attendees for their feedback on whether an e-vote should be held.

There were no objections.

BC and LL suggested that a vote could take place on the call.

FY noted that she had no issue with holding an e-vote and understood NN's reasoning for wanting to increase transparency.

NN asked the Secretariat to create a Doodle poll for the e-vote.

5. RIR IANA Performance Matrix

NN explained that some formatting and cosmetic improvements had been implemented to improve this year's report.

RJ gave a brief overview of the formatting changes and the edits he had made to the Matrix that he had circulated on the RC mailing list.

For the benefit of the new IANA RC members, NN gave an overview of the IANA RC's workflow:

- IANA publishes monthly reports on iana.org, which show whether requests have been responded to on time, implemented on time and whether they have been implemented accurately or not.
- RIR staff then summarizes the reports and create the RIR Matrix. It was decided that the RIRs should be tasked with completing this matrix rather than the IANA RC because the RIRs receive the services from IANA and can therefore comment on the level of service and accuracy.
- The IANA RC then publishes the RIR Matrix and gives the five RIR communities 30 days to comment.
- At the end of the 30-day comment period, the IANA RC holds a teleconference to finalize its report.

NN noted that the *iana-performance* mailing list had been set up and any comments received on the Matrix would be published on the IANA RC pages on the NRO website. She explained that one person from each region should be appointed to monitor the inbox.

She noted that no comments on the Matrix were received from the community last year. The IANA RC had discussed whether it had conducted sufficient outreach and concluded that it had done as much as it could have done.

JS asked if the IANA RC was comfortable with having only the summarized information on timing displayed in the Matrix or whether it would be prefer to have more detailed information displayed, stating exactly when a request was received and exactly when it was responded to.

JS also asked if the IANA RC would like the RIRs to provide a summarizing statement alongside the Matrix. This was not done last year.

JP noted that the allocations made in March and September were automated. He asked if that was acknowledged in the RIR Matrix and if not, whether it would be useful to do so.

NN commented (as a member of the IANA RC rather than as Chair) that she thought it would be useful to note that those allocations were made automatically. She added that she would also find a short summarizing statement by the RIRs useful. She noted that she thought that the timeframes currently noted in the Matrix were sufficient.

RJ agreed that the RIRs could provide a summarizing statement and that he would circulate it on the IANA RC mailing list shortly.

6. RC Report Work Plan

NN gave an overview of the proposed work plan for 2019:

Jan-Feb

- Announcement of RIR matrix
- Drafting of report
- Monitoring of feedback

RC Meeting 2 (Feb/Mar)

- Finalising report
- At the end of 30 day comment period

RC Meeting 3 (Mar)

- Final report
- Close any unresolved issues before publishing final report
- Publish final report

RC Meeting 4 (Mar/Apr)

- Post-Mortem
- RC Operating procedures

RC Meeting 5 (Nov/Dec)

- Preparation for 2020 report

There were no objections to the proposed work plan. The IANA RC agreed to move ahead according to this work plan.

NN noted that the RIR Matrix should be circulated on each of the RIR mailing lists next week and the 30-day comment period would then commence.

NEW ACTION 190117-1: NN/JS to publish RIR Matrix announcement by 22 January.

NN asked each region to propose a volunteer to monitor the *iana-performance* mailing list. The following IANA RC members volunteered: BC (APNIC), LL (ARIN), OO (AFRINIC), JP (LACNIC), and FY (RIPE NCC).

NN noted that LL had posted a link to the draft IANA RC 2018 Report.

LL and JP volunteered to update the report.

NN noted that she had experienced issues with Google Docs regarding version control. She suggested that once the draft report was updated, the text should be sent to the mailing list to ensure that everyone was commenting on the same version of the text before the next meeting.

NN asked the Secretariat to send out a Doodle Poll with options for the next meeting, with dates ranging from 25 Feb – 8 March, and a Doodle Poll with options for the placeholder meeting in March.

7. AOB

JP noted that an IANA RC teleconference had been scheduled during an ICANN Meeting last year and he wondered if it was an option to schedule a call again during the upcoming ICANN 64 Meeting.

NN noted that the IANA RC Charter states that the IANA RC must meet exclusively by teleconference. Those IANA RC members who had attended the ICANN Meeting had met physically and a teleconference was also set up for those who were not present to attend virtually. The IANA RC had concluded that little was gained from holding a physical meeting and so, as according to the Charter, only teleconferences would be held going forward. She added that if several IANA RC members were attending the upcoming ICANN Meeting, the opportunity to meet informally should be taken.

BC commented that he was unable to attend ICANN 64 and invited any IANA RC member who was attending the upcoming APRICOT Meeting to meet informally.

NN asked the IANA RC members to send a note to the mailing list if they would be attending ICANN 64/APRICOT and asked the Secretariat to help organize an informal gathering during the ICANN Meeting.

JS reminded the IANA RC members to vote in the IANA RC Chair election.

8. Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 13:19 UTC.