IANA Review Committee Meeting

13 March 2018
DRAFT Minutes

Attendees

AFRINIC
Madhvi Gokool (MG)
Noah Maina (NM)

APNIC
Simon Baroi (SB)
Bertrand Cherrier (BC)
Aftab Siddiqui (AS)
George Kuo (GK)

ARIN
Nate Davis (ND)
Louie Lee (LL)
Jason Schiller (JS) – Vice Chair

LACNIC
Nicolas Antoniello (NA)
Esteban Lescano (EL)
Ernesto Majó (EM)

RIPE NCC
Nurani Nimpuno (NN) (Chair)
Filiz Yilmaz (FY)

Secretariat
German Valdez (GV) - Executive Secretary
Susannah Gray (SG) – Secretariat/Scribe

Apologies
Andrew de la Haye (AdH)
Omo Oaiya (OO)

New Action Items

NEW ACTION ITEM
New Action Item 20180313-1: All to read the IANA RC Report and raise any objections or submit comments by 20 March.

Agenda

0. Welcome

1. Agenda Review
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Review of Open Action Items
4. Chair Election
5. Finalization of the RC Report
6. AOB
7. Adjournment

0. Welcome

NN welcomed the attendees and noted that there was representation on the call from all five regions.

1. Agenda Review

There were no additions or changes to the agenda.

2. Approval of Minutes

NN proposed that the minutes from the 5th IANA RC Meeting on 6 February 2018 be approved. There were no objections. NN asked the Secretariat to publish the minutes on the NRO website.

3. Review Open Actions

ACTION ITEM 20180206-01: ALL to review and comment on the updated matrix within 24 hours.

CLOSED.

ACTION ITEM 20180206-02: GV to add OO, BC, NA, JS, and NN to the iana-performance@nro.net mailing list.

CLOSED.

ACTION ITEM 20180206-03: GV to send out Doodle polls to secure dates for each of the five proposed RC meetings.

CLOSED.

ACTION ITEM 20180206-04: GV to set up the RC Chair election process.

CLOSED.

ACTION ITEM 20180206-05: NN to formulate a proposal regarding changing the RC election timelines.

OPEN: To be discussed during the next IANA RC meeting.

ACTION ITEM 20180206-06: GV add '0.Purpose' text to the RC page on the NRO website as a description of the RC's work.

CLOSED.

4. Chair Election

NN noted that, as she had been nominated for the position of Chair, she would like to ask the current Vice Chair, JS, to take over this section of the agenda.

JS explained that, as per the operating procedures, the IANA RC is supposed to open up the nominations for Chair at the beginning of the year, close the nominations during the first meeting of the year and then select the new Chair. The call for nominations was opened during the first RC meeting of 2018, which occurred in February. Due to the short timeline, there was concern that there might not be time for adequate participation. The nomination period was therefore kept open via email until today.

GV confirmed that no other nominations had been received via email and that the only nominee was NN. A reminder was also sent to the list.

JS made a final call for nominations and asked the RC if, at this point, anyone would like to self-nominate or nominate another person for the position of Chair.

There were no further nominations.

JS confirmed that there was only one nomination for Chair. He asked the RC if there was any opposition to appointing the only nominee, NN, to the position of Chair. There were no objections.

JS asked the RC if anyone felt that a formal election process was necessary. No one felt that an election process was necessary.

BC, LL, ND (via chat) noted their support of the nominee, NN.

LL proposed the motion that NN be selected as the IANA RC Chair for 2018. There were no objections. The motion carried an NN was declared Chair of the IC for 2018.

NN thanked the RC for its trust in her

5. Finalization of the RC Report

The RC discussed the 2017 IANA Numbering Services Review Committee Report.

JS noted that the RC's initial operating procedures stated that the report would cover a period of one year. He explained that these operating procedures were later changed to state that the report would cover one calendar year but this change has not yet been reflected in the official operating procedures. He added that, in addition to the one calendar year, the RC was asked by the NRO NC to include a segment prior to the beginning of the calendar year in the report. However, neither of these was reflected in the current report, as the performance metrics for the IANA services were not developed until the end of February so the reporting did not start until March. He added that this should not be an issue for future reports.

LL noted that, in earlier drafts, space was reserved for the RIRs to add a summarizing statement. He noted that no statement had been received and he was not expecting one to be provided. He

suggested keeping this section as a placeholder in case a statement needed to be included in future reports.

ND asked if the RC felt it was important to include a statement from the RIRs.

NN explained that this section was added on the assumption that the RIRs might want to include a summarizing statement but that she did not feel that it was necessary to include one.

JS agreed that it was not important to include a summarizing statement but that the placeholder should be kept in case the RIRs want to provide input into future reports.

LL explained that a section was added to the report to list comments from the community: no comments were received during the comment period. A link to the community input page on the NRO website should, however, be included in the report.

NN noted that it was agreed that all comments received were to be gathered and published on the NRO website in the RC section. Even though no comments were received, she also agreed that a link to the comments page should be included in the report.

LL gave an overview of the conclusions: the RC evaluated the data sets and observed that two IPv4 requests and two ASN requests were made. They were fulfilled accurately and on time during the timeframe. There has been no indication of failure or near failure by the IANA Numbering Services Operator to meet its obligations under the SLA.

NN asked the RC if anyone thought that the conclusion as outlined by LL was incorrect.

The RC believed the conclusion to be correct and accurate.

NN thanked LL and JS for their efforts compiling the report.

NN noted that, during the last RC meeting, a placeholder meeting was scheduled for two weeks after the March meeting in case there were unresolved or contentious issues to discuss. She noted that she did not believe there were any issues to deal with.

She proposed that the RC read through the report and raise any further comments or objections within the next week. If there were no objections, she proposed that the report be adopted as written and that the placeholder meeting would be cancelled.

There were no objections to this proposal.

New Action Item 20180313-1: All to read the IANA RC Report and raise any objections or submit comments by 20 March.

NN thanked the RIRs for their work in putting together the matrix. She noted that she interpreted the fact that there were no community comments on the matrix as a positive thing.

LL noted that he would create a template for the next report once the current report is finalized.

JS added that the final report would be published as a PDF.

6. **AoB**

No other business was discussed.

7. **Adjourn**

The meeting ended at 07:44 AST (11:44 UTC).